EFFECTIVENESS OF CAREER DEVELOPMENT AND COGNITIVE REFRAIME THERAPY ON IRRATIONAL CAREER THOUGHTS AMONG SECONDARY SCHOOL STUDENTS IN OGUN STATE, NIGERIA

Adedunni O. Adegun
Oyesoji Aremu
University of Ibadan

Abstract

Choosing a professional career is an important step that influences the aspirations of students. Students sometimes are unable to make a decision about the career they wish to pursue later in life. Career practitioners in Nigeria have observed that most secondary school leavers in Nigeria often make poor career decisions due to unrealistic vocational aspirations. Despite vast researches on adolescents’ career problems, irrational career thought remain largely understudied within the field of vocational psychology in Nigeria. This study examined the effectiveness of Career Development (CD) and Cognitive Reframe (CR) therapy in reducing irrational career thoughts of secondary school students. A sample of 96 Senior Secondary School one students with irrational career thoughts were purposively selected from three randomly selected Senior Secondary Schools in Ogun State Nigeria. There were two treatment conditions (CD and CR) that lasted for seven weeks. Career Thought Inventory (α = 0.86) was use to collect data. Data were analyzed using Analysis of Covariance. There was a significant main effect of treatment on dysfunctional career thoughts of secondary school students. CD and CR were found to be effective in reducing irrational career thoughts of secondary school students. Implications of these on career development in Nigeria were discussed.

Key Words: Career development therapy, Cognitive reframes, Irrational career thoughts, Secondary school students, Nigeria.

Introduction

Making the right career choice that would keep adolescents relevant in the scheme of things in an emerging economy like Nigeria could be daunting and difficult. Nigerian adolescents in secondary schools are often preoccupied with so many thoughts of future career prospects. This, more often than not, often predispose these adolescents to irrational thoughts. Such irrational thoughts could be debilitating to the society and psychological well-being of adolescents. Transition from secondary school to workplace, college or university is a critical path through which every adolescent must pass through (Cassie, 2005). However, it is not uncommon to aver that many of these adolescents are left unguarded while transiting from college to workplace. Most often, parents, teachers, and friends have encouraged secondary school students to proceed to the university while a good number of secondary school students may end up attending universities without knowing why or what they intend to study. For many, this is an important time for career-related matters that will be beneficial to them. As they face the need to choose an academic major, as well as to develop career goals for the future, career problems often become a developmental phase they must pass through in making proper career choices for life.

Several studies have been conducted on adjustment difficulties adolescents face in relation to career and planning. (Hiebert, Collins & Robinson 2001; Magnusson & Bernes, 2001; Pyne & Bernes, 2002; Pyne, Bernes, Magnusson & Poulsen, 2002; Bardick, Bernes, Magnussson & Witko, 2004). Adolescents have received a lot of attention because it is at this stage of life that individuals first begin to prepare and eventually train themselves for a future career in order to become independent adults.

Career development process should start at an early age. Learning about different careers early could enable students have a better understanding of types of jobs they would want to explore in the future. Career process may start formally as early as primary school and could continue throughout secondary school because of many uncertainties especially in an unstable economy like ours. Career uncertainty among secondary school students remains a constant challenge in the entire globe. According to Rosenbaum (2001), in a national survey in the United State of America, nearly all high school seniors (95%) plan to attend college. A study indicated that approximately 20 per cent of students who attend four year college are undecided as freshmen (Hayes, 1997). This transition from
secondary school to university may be extremely difficult for many students, leaving them with unanswered questions and confusion when it comes to choosing a career. Adolescents in Nigeria are not exempted from this career dilemma. The foregoing problem has led to several studies in career development among adolescents in secondary schools by some researchers over the years in Nigeria (Adeyemo, 1996, 1998, 1999; Kuti, 1979; Osakinle & Adegoroye, 2008; Salami, 1997, 2000). Writing on the dilemma faced by young adults, Schneider and Stevenson (1999) were of the opinion that career development is an important aspect of adolescent life. They reasoned that though adolescents were more than ever motivated, nevertheless, they appeared directionless. It can be reasoned that young people have high ambitions. They are naturally motivated and develop some great quest for good education. With all these, adolescents might have difficulties in developing coherent plans for achieving these goals. Career guidance and academic counselling can therefore, provide students with the necessary tools to set career goals, and give them an understanding of the education and skills needed to meet their goals.

Career decidedness is a dynamic and interactive problem space that has been the subject of research in Nigeria over the years (Adeyemo, 1996, 1998, 1999; Kuti, 1979; Salami, 1997, 2001a, 2001b, 2003, 2004, 2005; Salami & Onyeacho, 1998). Further studies showed that most secondary school leavers in Nigeria make poor career decisions because of their unrealistic vocational aspirations. It is reported that students select occupations mainly because of the salaries, positions, glamour and prestige attached to them (Salami, 1997). For instance, adolescents prefer medicine, engineering, law, banking, architecture, and pharmacy as professions they intend to enter into after graduating from secondary school without adequate knowledge of what it takes to succeed and achieve in those occupations (Salami, 2000). It is therefore important that secondary school counsellors help adolescents make satisfying educational and occupational decisions.

In a developing country like Nigeria, career counselling is needed as a vital tool for developing youths. The choice of a career especially among diverse options is usually a difficult task among adolescents. There is need to guide adolescents in planning for careers and making life fulfilling decisions. Again, the school system has been seen to be responsible for assisting adolescents in making competent career decisions that are appropriate to their abilities, attitudes, interests and other personality characteristics. School administrators must strive to assist students through adequate career counselling, providing guidance in career selection by qualified career counsellors in schools to help students overcome irrational career thoughts.

Sampson, Peterson, Lenz, Reardon and Saunders (1996) were the first scholars to identify irrational career thoughts as a component of career decision making process. Sampson et al. (1996) sought to enhance career decision-making among students by helping them reduce the impact of irrational career thinking on their career decisions, themselves, options, and decision-making abilities. These could contribute to indecision, anxiety and depression, that may in turn hinder proper career development and later life adjustment (e.g. inability to get a gainful employment after graduation may alter the ability to move from being a dependent adolescent to an independent adult.).

Irrational career thought according to Sampson et al (1996) is a perceptual way of viewing oneself in a manner that inhibits career problem-solving and decision-making. Researchers have found irrational career thoughts to be a strong indicator of career indecision (Osborn, 1998; Saunders, Peterson, Reardon, & Sampson, 2000). According to Saunders et al (2000) this accounts for 61 per cent of the variance in career indecision. Research has brought to the fore the presence of irrational career beliefs and thoughts in adolescence. This phenomenon has been labeled by various professionals in the past as myths (Dorn & Welch, 1985), self-defeating assumptions (Dryden, 1979), dysfunctional career beliefs (Krumbloltz, 1990), and dysfunctional cognitions (Corbishley & Yost, 1989). All these point to the seriousness of irrational career thoughts among adolescents.

Some studies have further shown that irrational career thoughts are related to some emotional states in adolescents such as perfectionism (Osborn, 1998), anger expression (Strausberger, 1998), and depression (Saunders, Sampson, Peterson, & Reardon, 2000). These emotional states can be linked to decision-making problems. Sampson et al. (1996b) reported that the Career Thoughts Inventory (CTI) accurately discriminated between clients (those seeking career services) and non-clients, with clients always indicating more negative or irrational career thoughts. In all, the above stated studies suggest a relationship between irrational career thoughts and career decision which, in turn, interfere with the capacity for effective career problem-solving and decision-making. Career development and cognitive reframe therapy are designed to help identify and address irrational career
thoughts which are not only theoretically relevant to career planning, but also practical in their application (Peterson, Sampson & Reardon, 1991). Classes in career development usually have self-exploration and reflection built into their design and could contribute to developing self-confidence in student.

Career development therapy has been observed to have positive effect on students in general (Folsom & Reardon, 2000; Whiston, Sexton & Lasoff, 1998). Career development therapy had resulted in reduction of negative traits, including career indecision (Johnson, Nichols, Buboltz & Riedesel, 2002; Peng, 2001), irrational career thoughts (Reed, Reardon, Lenz & Leierer, 2001), as well as increases in positive traits such as career decidedness (Johnson, Nichols, Buboltz & Riedesel 2002). In addition, Folsom, Peterson, Reardon and Mann (2002) observed that students who completed an undergraduate career planning course had higher graduation rates when compared to the general student population (81% compared with 69%) and graduated with fewer credit hours on average than the general population (110 compared with 132).

People’s perception about themselves and their career choice affect their ability to make decisions. Cognitive reframe focuses on actively changing the pre-existing schema underlying automatic thoughts that may hinder performance of a specific task (Kinnier & Krumboltz, 1986). Sampson et al. (1996) suggested that cognitive reframe may be one intervention counsellors can use to assist clients in combating irrational career thoughts. Most adolescents are unaware of the biases, misinformation, and distorted beliefs that they bring to career choice and that these presuppositions can lead to self-defeating and disabling experiences (Krumboltz, 1983). Elliott (1995) noted that negative self-statements can impair a client’s ability to utilise occupational information, lead to career indecision, and inappropriate choices. Instruction in reframing, by which students learn to change their irrational thoughts to more functional ones is often an important part of cognitive reframe treatments.

According to Bandura (1977), one of the most effective ways to change cognitions is to change behaviour. Based on this premise, cognitive reframe uses experience to create feedback loops, which challenges irrational thoughts and assumptions and increase positive feelings. The desired outcome of cognitive reframe is increased self-control by enabling more accurate processing of information and interpretation of events. The ultimate goal in cognitive reframe interventions is to teach clients the art of auto-cognitive reframe. Clients are trained to recognise, examine, and modify or refute maladaptive cognitions whenever they emerge in the future.

The positive effect of career development and cognitive reframe therapy has been consistently demonstrated in foreign countries as related in the studies cited above. In Nigeria, these have not been sufficiently done. Therefore, there is the need to investigate if these interventions will be useful so as to inculcate them into our schools’ curriculum to help these students make the appropriate career choice as they transit from childhood to adolescence and finally to adulthood.

Although many studies have investigated factors influencing the career decision-making process in adolescence in Nigeria over the years (Adeyemo 1996, 1998, 1999, 2001, 2006; Salami & Oneyeacho 1998; Osakinle & Adegoroye, 2008; Osakinle, 2009; Okafor, 2004; Salami 1997, 1999, 2000, 2001, 2005; Kuti 1979; Kolo, 1987), irrational career thought remain a largely understudied field within vocational psychology and career counselling in Nigeria. With this expressed problem, this study experimentally investigates the effectiveness of career development and cognitive reframe therapy on irrational career thoughts of secondary school students. In articulating this research problem, we postulated that there is no significant main effect of treatment on irrational career thoughts of secondary school students. Our assumption from this hypothesis is to experimentally establish the efficacy of CDT and CRT on irrational career thoughts among Nigerian adolescents. Knowing well that we could not cover a large population of adolescents, we limited our investigation to adolescents in Ogun State, Nigeria.

Methodology

Research Design

This study employed a pre-test, post-test and control group quasi-experimental design to investigate the effectiveness of career development and cognitive reframe therapy on irrational career thoughts
among secondary school students. Through this design, we experimentally subjected the adolescents to two interventions (CD and CR).

**Sample and Sampling Techniques**

The study adopted the multistage and purposive random technique to choose the sample. There are 20 local government areas (LGAS) in Ogun State, Nigeria. Ogun State is one of the 36 states in Nigeria. It is in the Southern part of the country. Ogun State like many states in Nigeria has three senatorial districts (Ogun Central, Ogun East and Ogun West). This is delineated for political representation at the national assembly. Simple random sampling technique was employed to select one L.G.A each from the three senatorial districts and one school each was selected using the ballot system from each of the local governments selected.

Using the Career Thought Inventory by Peterson et al (1996) as the screening instrument, a sample of 96 Senior Secondary One (1) students with irrational career thoughts was purposively selected from three Senior Secondary Schools out of the 272 Senior Secondary Schools in Ogun State (CD Group 32, CR Group 30 and Control 34).

**Demographic Information of the 96 participants in the study**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>distribution</th>
<th>number</th>
<th>percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Research Instruments**

The researchers made use of Career Thought Inventory (CTI)

**Career Thought Inventory**

Career Thought Inventory (CTI) of Sampson et al (1996) is designed to measure irrational career thoughts in career problem-solving and career decision-making. The CTI is based on the Cognitive Information Processing approach (CIP; Peterson, Sampson & Reardon, 1991; Peterson, Sampson, Lenz & Reardon, 2002; Peterson, Sampson, Reardon & Lenz, 1996; Sampson, Reardon, Peterson, & Lenz, 2004) derived from cognitive therapy (Beck, 1976; Beck, Freeman, Davis, 2004; Beck, Rush, Shaw & Emer., 1979), cognitive reframe (Meichenbaum, 1977), and information processing theory (Newell & Simon, 1972). The CTI is a self-administered instrument consisting of 48 negative statements to which individuals respond using a 4-point rating scale ranging from “Strongly Agree” (0) to “Strongly Disagree” (3). Typically, the CTI can be administered in 7 to 15 minutes. The CTI total scores range from 0 to 144 and represents a single global indicator of irrational career thoughts in career problem-solving and decision-making. Higher CTI total scores are indicative of greater levels of irrational career thoughts.

The CTI also yields scores on three construct scales. The 14-item Decision-Making Confusion (DMC) scale reflects an inability to initiate or sustain the decision making process as a result of disabling emotions and/or lack of understanding about the decision making process itself (Sampson et al., 1996). The 10-item Commitment Anxiety (CA) scale reflects and inability to make a commitment to a specific career choice, accompanied by generalised anxiety about the outcome of the decision making process. The 5-item External Conflict (EC) scale reflects an inability to balance the importance of one’s self-perceptions with the importance of input from significant others, resulting in a reluctance to assume responsibility for decision-making. A typical example of the items in CTI are: I’m afraid if I try out my chosen occupation, I won’t be successful; I can’t think of any field of study or occupation that seems interesting.

Sampson et al. (1996) reported Cronbach’s alpha internal consistency reliabilities of 0.93 to 0.97 for the total score of the CTI, 0.90 to 0.94 for the DMCS (14 items), 0.79 to 0.91 for the CA scale (10 items), and 0.74 to 0.81 for the EC scale (5 items). Test-retest reliability was measured in
secondary school students across four weeks and the reliability was 0.86 for the total CTI score.

**Procedures for Treatment Packages**

The researchers sought permission through a letter written to the Teaching Service
Commission, Ogun State, Nigeria. With permission granted, principals of schools to be used for the experiment were contacted. These schools were visited beforehand to enable the researchers get acquainted with the schools and their environment. The concerned people (principal, teachers and students) were adequately informed of the purpose of the research work and what the participants stand to benefit. Participants were also given consent forms through which permission was sought from their parents.

The study was completed within the school term to avoid time lag. The researchers with the assistance of six research assistants and class teachers in each of the schools used held 90 minutes sessions for each of the experimental groups for seven weeks, while the control group was engaged with their daily school work activities.

The CTI (Sampson et al., 1996a) was administered at the beginning and at the end of treatment sessions as a pretest and posttest instrument to measure participants’ irrational thoughts. Participants with career thought were enrolled into the experimental groups. Researchers discussed the concept of irrational career thoughts as well as the impact that irrational thinking has on making a career decision. Students who needed more personalised, one-on-one help in reframing a career statement were offered individual appointments with the researchers and some were referred to the school counsellors.

The intervention sessions are briefed below:

**Experimental Group 1: Career Development**

The seven sessions covered the following:

**Session I:** Pre-test administration and general orientation on concept of career development

**Session II:** Career Development Theories

**Session III:** Irrational career thoughts

**Session IV:** Identifying personality type, interest, skills, abilities and values

**Session V:** Relating personal characteristics and career goals to academic majors

**Session VI:** Creating a customised career action plan

**Session VII:** Revision of all activities in previous sessions and re-administration of research instruments for post test scores.

**Experimental Group 2: Cognitive Reframe**

**Session I:** Administration of instrument to obtain pretest scores and general orientation on the concept of cognitive reframe

**Session II:** Identifying irrational career thoughts

**Session III:** Cognitive Information Processing Theory in relation to irrational career thoughts

**Session IV:** Explanation on how to challenge irrational career thoughts

**Session V:** The CASVE Cycle

**Session VI:** Creating a plan to act on new, more adaptive thoughts
**Session VII:** Revision of all activities in previous sessions and re-administration of CTI for post test scores.

**Control group**

**Session 1:** Administration of pre-test instrument.

**Session 2:** Administration of post-test instrument on the 7th week

**Data Analysis**

Analysis of covariance (ANCOVA) was used to test the research hypothesis to determine the significance of the hypothesis.

**Table 1: Analysis of Covariance (ANCOVA)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of variation</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Covariates</td>
<td>11378.963</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11378.963</td>
<td>76.071</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRETEST</td>
<td>11378.963</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11378.963</td>
<td>76.071</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Effects</td>
<td>49744.655</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>24872.328</td>
<td>166.278</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRTGROUP</td>
<td>49744.655</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>24872.328</td>
<td>166.278</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explained</td>
<td>61123.618</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>20374.539</td>
<td>136.209</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>13761.621</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>149.583</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>74885.240</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>788.266</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 2: Multiple Classification Analysis**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of variation</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Unadjusted</th>
<th>Eta</th>
<th>Adjusted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand Mean = 48.86</td>
<td></td>
<td>Variation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Treatment Groups:**

1 Career Development 32 -20.11 -19.21
2 Cognitive Reframe   30 -15.93 -14.97
3 Control             34  32.99  31.29
                      .88 .83

Multiple R-Square .816
Multiple R .903
Summary of Findings

This study examined the effectiveness of career development and cognitive reframe therapy on the irrational career thoughts of secondary school students in Ogun State, Nigeria. The finding is summarized as follows: there is significant main effect of treatment on dysfunctional career thoughts of secondary school students.

Discussion of Findings

The finding showed that there is a significant main effect of treatment on the irrational career thoughts of participants in experimental groups and that of the control group. This implies that career development and cognitive reframe therapy were effective in reducing irrational career thoughts of secondary school students. The adjusted means of the three groups were 28.75, 32.93 and 80.85 for CDC, CR and control groups respectively. The adjusted means were obtained by summing the grand mean ($= 48.86$) to the respective adjusted deviations. This shows that the two experimental groups were superior to the control group, while career development was superior to cognitive reframe therapy in reducing irrational career thoughts of secondary school students. The adjusted means were obtained by summing the grand mean (x= 48.86) to the respective adjusted deviations. This shows that the two experimental groups were superior to the control group, while career development was superior to cognitive reframe therapy in reducing irrational career thoughts of secondary school students. The adjusted means were obtained by summing the grand mean (x= 48.86) to the respective adjusted deviations. This shows that the two experimental groups were superior to the control group, while career development was superior to cognitive reframe therapy in reducing irrational career thoughts of secondary school students. The adjusted means were obtained by summing the grand mean (x= 48.86) to the respective adjusted deviations.

Several studies have examined the effectiveness of cognitive reframe in modifying dysfunctional career thoughts (Kinnier & Krumboltz, 1986; Flavell, 1979; Bandura 1977; Paris & Winograd, 1990; Peterson, Sampson, Lenz, & Reardon, 2002). Our findings therefore corroborated what was reported in literature. The ultimate goal in cognitive reframe therapy is to teach clients the art of auto-cognitive reframe. Clients are trained to recognise, examine and modify maladaptive cognitions whenever they emerge. According to Bandura (1977), one of the most effective ways to change cognitions is to change behaviour. Based on this premise, cognitive reframe uses experience to create feedback loops, which challenges irrational thoughts and assumptions and increase positive feelings. Perhaps this is the reason for the effectiveness of this cognitive reframe on irrational career thoughts.

Implication for Policy and Career Development

From our findings, we conclude that career development and cognitive reframe therapy were effective in the reduction of dysfunctional career thoughts among students in secondary schools. Thus introduction of career development would help in a great way in reducing students irrational career thoughts and if the principles of cognitive reframe are properly applied, students would develop well informed career plans. The implication is for curriculum development on career in secondary schools. More than this, the school counselors in Nigeria could also be more proactive in the mean time given the thrusts of the current findings.

As novel as the findings are, they are with some limitations. First, the number of participants was 96. This somehow limited the generalization of the findings to the entire spectrum of adolescents in Senior Secondary Schools. However, the strength of the findings lies in the fact that it is an
experimental study that doesn’t require a large population. The study therefore has contributed significantly to the body of knowledge on career development, as this study to the best knowledge of the researchers knowledge is the first study to utilize career development and cognitive reframe therapy in reducing irrational career thoughts in Nigeria.

Conclusion

Based on the findings of the study, the following conclusions were reached:

While career development and cognitive reframe therapy were effective in reduction of irrational career thoughts, career development therapy was more effective. Therefore, an introduction of career development courses into the secondary schools curriculum in Nigeria will help in eliminating students’ irrational career thoughts among the students.

References


**Author Notes**

Adedunni O. Adegun

&

Oyesoji Aremu

Department of Guidance & Counselling,
University of Ibadan

talkin2loba@yahoo.com